

DRAFT: corrections in these minutes should be submitted in writing to the stated clerk within ten days of receipt. If no corrections are received within that period, all items shall be considered correct. These minutes are not an official record of the presbytery until approved by the body.

**MAUMEE VALLEY PRESBYTERY**  
**STATED MEETING**  
**Christ Presbyterian Church, Toledo, Ohio**  
**Tuesday, September 17, 2024**

**THE ROLL**

**MINISTER MEMBERS**

**Present**

Bartley, Dave, HR  
Bella, Roberta  
Brown, Bruce  
Butcher, Robert, HR  
Clendenin, Ruth Ellen  
Commeret, Jessica  
Emery, Thomas  
Desterhaft, Janice  
Gay, Jeanne, HR  
Hodsden, Sara  
Holmes, Douglas

Hruaia, J H Vanlal  
Johnson-Paine, Cathy  
Kim, Jin Seung  
King, Cathi  
Kling, Julie  
Layraman, Tawee, HR  
McCandless, Mary Beth  
McClellan, Alex, HR  
McGormley, Dean, HR  
McGormley, Ellen, HR  
Meinke, Matt

Merold, Steve  
Miller, R. James  
Murr, Barry, HR  
Remaklus, Amy  
Rivera-Torea, Kathryn  
Rowland Miller, Susan  
Schooley, Jeffrey  
Short, Pamela, HR  
Speakman, Stephen  
Steensma, Thomas, HR  
Wasson, Ann

**Excused**

Aber, David, HR  
Bell, George, HR  
Brewer, Jr., Clair, HR  
Burnett, William, HR  
Chorle, Kenneth, HR  
Clancy, Nan  
Cooper, Mark, HR  
Esterly, Barbara, HR  
Gallant, Melinda, HR  
Good, David, HR  
Hodsden, James

Hoff, Rick, HR  
Kivlin, Keith, HR  
Ladd, Dennis, HR  
Leckrone, Donald, HR  
Lemon, Jack, HR  
Mills, Harold, HR  
Myers, Alton, HR  
Nutting, Cheryl, HR  
Pannabecker, Donald, HR  
Pitt, Gavin, HR  
Resseguie, James, HR

Saunders, Gary, HR  
Saunders, Mary, HR  
Schwartz, Tom, HR  
Smith, William, HR  
Sweet, Barry, HR  
Treadway, Kathryn  
Wessler, Kenneth  
Young, David, HR  
Zuehlke, Beth, HR

**Absent**

Brundage, Chris  
Chandler, Doris  
James, Tom  
Metcalf, Darcy  
Middleton, William

Pech, Leo  
Pistoria, Tomas  
Rife, Richard  
Ross, Sarah  
Stecker, Michelle

Tolbert, Clint  
Williams, Alicia  
Zuehlke, Matthew

**RULING ELDER COMMISSIONERS**

**Present**

Adrian, First, Scott Elliot  
Adrian, Cadmus, Tiffani Kisor  
Bluffton, Lori Schmidt  
Bowling Green, First, Anne Moser  
Clyde, First, Lynda Wilbert  
Defiance, First, Joel Youkers  
Findlay First, Diana Wagar  
Huron First, Phillip Hopkins

Lima Faith, James Cooper  
Lima Market Street, Ruth Hardesty  
Maumee First, John Sluhan  
Maumee First, Sherry Stiles  
Milan, Donald Loving  
Montpelier West Bethesda, Michael Cox  
Napoleon, First, Lynn Yarnell  
Ottawa, Beth Myers

Palmyra Community, Doris Van Sickle  
Perrysburg First, Kathy Jarosz  
Sandusky First, Norma Wible  
Tecumseh First, David Hammond  
Tiffin First, Bill Treadway

Toledo Christ, Carole Gildemeister  
Toledo Collingwood, Mary Weil  
Toledo Eastminster, Mike Kowalec  
Van Wert, First, Bill Knoll  
Waterville First, Dave Woodward

**Excused**

Fremont East Side, Ann Weiler  
Fremont First, William Taylor

Galion First, Gary Proietti  
Kenton, Trinity United, Julie Crowe

**Absent** *(no commissioner present)*

Antwerp, First United,  
Blissfield, First,  
Britton, Raisin,  
Bryan, First  
Bucyrus, First  
Cecil  
Celina, First,  
Delphos, First United  
Dola  
Erie, First,  
Findlay, Enon Valley  
Findlay, Faith  
Findlay, First  
Forest, First  
Fostoria, First,  
Grand Rapids, First  
LaSalle First

Marseilles  
McComb, First  
Monroe, First  
Montpelier, First,  
Montpelier, West Eagle Creek  
Norwalk First  
Pemberville First,  
Port Clinton, Firelands  
Shelby First  
Toledo Christ  
Toledo, Fairgreen,  
Toledo, Hanmi Covenant  
Tontogany  
Upper Sandusky  
Van Buren  
Venedocia, Salem  
West Unity, First

***OTHERS (Presbytery Officers, Commission Moderator Elders, Commissioned Ruling Elders, Former Ruling Elder Moderators, Certified Christian Educators, Corresponding Members)***

**Present**

Armstrong, Jason, Maumee, Commission Chair  
Bettendorf, Ed, Firelands, Commission Chair  
Chip Hardwick, Miami Valley Presbytery  
Hopkins, Jeaneane, Former Moderator  
Jones, Rose, CP  
Juhasz, Jen, CCE, Christ Presbyterian, Toledo

Kirkconnell, Leslee, CCE, Findlay First Presbyterian  
Myers, Chas, Former Moderator  
Roadruck, Mike, CP, Toledo Fairgreen  
Tolhurst, Harry, CP  
Wiesmann, Lance, CP

**Excused**

Manon, Lora, CP  
Burnworth, Carole, Eastminster, Moderator

**Absent**

Berkheiser, Nancy, CP  
Fogle, Julie, CP

Louden-Hanes, Marie  
Pennington, Mike CP

**VISITORS**

Bella, Wes, Firelands, Port Clinton  
Bradley, Grace, FPC Montpelier  
Gillin, Lisa, Arian First  
Kaiser, Dottie, Market Street Presbyterian Church Lima  
King, Belinda, MVP  
Kuhlman, Sheri, Toledo Collingwood

McCollow, Robert, Salem Venedocia  
Merold Kae  
Murray Julie, Toledo Fairgreen  
Palmer, Christine, Collingwood  
Rohrer, Landon, Inquirer, Maumee First  
Wies-Haithcock Terri – Faith Christian Church

**GETTING ORGANIZED** The meeting was called to order with prayer at 3:03PM by Vice Moderator Rev Doug Holmes. A quorum was declared.

Stated Clerk Dean McGormley Adoption of the Docket (Packet 1)

Dean McGormley Clerk

**ON MOTION: To approve the docket. Approved.**

**ON MOTION: To approve the Minutes of May 21, 2024, with correction. Approved.**

Seating of Corresponding Members

**ON MOTION: To seat Chip Hardwick, Miami Valley Presbytery, as a corresponding member. Approved.**

Privileges of the Floor:

**ON MOTION: To grant privileges of the floor to TSAD Janet Brehm Taylor.**

**Approved.**

Report of the Clerk - minister's cards available (dated through May 2025)

Welcome from the Host Pastor (Ruth Clendenin) housekeeping – welcome – instructions about visitors

Recognition of First Time Commissioners – Mary Weil, Collingwood; Tiffany Kisor, Cadmus

**3:15 Report of General Presbyter** (Packet 2a, 2b)

Matt Meinke

Land acknowledgment – historic first people's of Ohio; Shared passwords and Breeze App. Deaths – Rev. David Cook on 7/18/24; Rev. Ralph Middleton on 8/11/24; Rev. Jack Hess on 9/15/24 (service this Thursday, 3:30, FPC Defiance); exciting things in the presbytery re creative ministries; Orddiversaries. Presided at Michigan wedding of Matthew Miller and Kristy Jo Wingate in Lambertville, MI on 8/17/2024.

**3:25 Report of Synod Executive**

Chip Hardwick

Chip reported on synod scholarships (results in October); more money budgeted for 2025; Matthew 25 grants due by Sept 30; up to \$5000; new webinar on Toxic Polarization in preparation for election (check website); Monthly preaching workshop – Lyrical theology and hymns as midrashim. Chip reported on Tim Pollack's work with the Synod, leading Commissioned Ruling Elders cohort, and concluded by announcing the Synod is looking for a Treasurer (volunteer position) [synodofthecovenant.org](http://synodofthecovenant.org)

**3:35 Central Support** (Packet 3)

Chas Myers

**Financial reports** (Packet 3a, 3b, 3c)

Chas Myers, chair of Central Support, called on Treasurer David Bartley, to speak to the financials, reporting reductions in committee meeting expenses, namely no expensive PJC cases for a few years (attorney expenses).

**Budget** (Packet 3d, 3e)

David Bartley

**ON MOTION** to keep the Presbytery amount of Per Capita to remain at \$26.05 for 2025  
**No discussion. Motion carries.**

PLEASE NOTE: There will be modest increases in the Synod and G.A. portions of the Per Capita but WE DO NOT VOTE on these increases. So Synod Per Capita will be \$3.40 and G.A. will be \$10.84 for a total Per Capita of **\$40.29** for 2025.

**ON MOTION to approve the 2025 budget for MVP as presented.**

David Bartley, Treasurer spoke of the surplus from previous years and investment income has been used to balance the budget; grants, endowments; If Mission giving declines – the mission budget will decline.

Questions and discussion: Jessie Commeret; Jeff Schooley “status quo budget”;

Jeff Schooley moved to table the budget until November meetings; Second. Failed

More discussion: Katie Rivera-Torea

**Motion carries with some dissent**

**Commission on Churches Closing**

Ed Bettendorf

Ed reported that the Congregation of Erie Presbyterian Church in Erie, MI has voted to close with a final service on Sunday Nov 3, 2024. He also spoke to the interest in the property and possible offers, including the township. There will be a market study with township for church, manse and grounds (historical museum/community center/farmers market). Hopeful for motion in November.

Fremont First and Eastside – working toward a merger – joint worship – also including stewardship; they are making good progress toward this in their unified session meeting. Rep from Eastside requested that Freemont could help. Freemont first would pay the balance of the larger repair for the Eastside’s roof.

Ed also reported for Central Support on a mission project at Hanmi – requesting folks to help repair Hanmi,fence.

**There was no report from the Nominations Team.**

**Mission** (Packet 4a, 4b)

Cathi King

Matthew 25 Grant money is still available. Leo – mission trip to Mexico- families 38 adults; 90 people in addition to team every night. Possible future trips – talk to Leo; Katie inquired about a connection the other direction; ESL – Perrysburg – schools. Connections with the people there. Build a second floor?

Jessie Commeret – presbytery event – FPC Findlay and Mission Commission partnering to provide a workshop – reimaging mission. Sept 28 – 9-3 - \$30 for the day.

**Discipleship** (Packets 5a, 5b, 5c, 5d, 5e)

Amy Remaklus

Boundary Training (5b)

Spiritual Formation – and God rested, by Pamela Short. Retreat October 13, 14 and 15 (5C)

Rekindle November 8-10 at Kirkmont – and Camp Rejoice – Jeff and Katie did lessons – paper chain – camper’s loves linked together – prizes for most campers

\$50 to most Junior Campers - Christ Presbyterian

\$50 most junior high campers – Ottawa

\$50 to most Senior High Campers – Bowling Green

Most campers at Camp Rejoice – Christ Presbyterian

most at Kirkmont this summer – Ottawa.

Sara Hodsdon, on behalf of the Preparation for Ministry Teams reported that Discipleship has **enrolled two inquirers:**

**Scott Elliott (elder at Adrian); Landon Rohrer (Maumee)**

**New Worshipping Communities** (Packet 6)

Jason Armstrong

Jason presented his report including a 1001 Document – *To whom and where is God sending us?*  
Video was shared.

**At 4:48 the moderator declared a stretch break.**

**4:53 Leadership Commission made their report.** (Packet 7a, 7b, 7c, 7d, 7e)

Ann Wasson

### **Minimum Terms of Call for Ministers**

**ON MOTION that Maumee Valley Presbytery adopt the 2025 Minimum Compensation Standards (attachment 7b), specifically, that:**

**In 2025 Maumee Valley Presbytery’s Minimum Compensation Standards will be set based on the Total Cost to the Congregation: \$78,100 for full-time minimum terms of call in 2025, \$81,400 in 2026** (numbers calculated based on the medians from BOP).

Additionally:

- 1) Pastors currently enrolled (enrolled before 12/31/2024) in the Pastor’s Participation Plan shall be enrolled in the Transitional Pastor’s Plan for the year 2025 unless the pastor chooses otherwise.** (Dues = 43% of Total Effective Salary)
- 2) Congregations made a commitment and shall retain the effective salary of their pastor, keeping commitments to the promises made to the pastor when calling them.**

Discussion – Jeff Schooley concerned about low amount total and what that means for the future; Susan Rowland Miller – was there a possible minimum for the differing needs for insurance? Matt Meinke – justice issue – GA Task Force formed to look into.

Includes many mid council leaders. Steve Merold – what does the presbytery provide for those who believe their package is unjust. Ann – working toward a new future.

Commission will help. Call for the Question.

**Motion carries.**

### **Compensation Standards for CREs and CCEs**

**ON MOTION that Maumee Valley Presbytery’s Minimum Compensation Standards for full-time Commissioned Ruling Elders (CREs) and Certified Christian Educators (CCE) Serving Churches will be based on the Total Cost to the Congregation: 80% of the Minimum Compensation Standard for Ministers, or \$62,480 for full-time in 2025, and \$65,120 in 2026.**

**Motion carries**

### Administrative Commission

**ON MOTION** that the presbytery appoint an Administrative Commission for First Montpelier, OH to counsel with the session concerning reported difficulties in the session and congregation, acting to resolve the conflict and correct those difficulties. This commission will have the power to assume original jurisdiction if they cannot resolve the conflict. The Commission recommends the following to be elected to this Administrative Commission: TE Doris Chandler (Moderator), TE Jessica Commeret, Carl Jacobs (RE Cadmus); Marcia Carr (RE Defiance). **Motion carries.**

### Waiver for West Eagle Creek

**ON MOTION** the approval of the written request from West Eagle Creek Presbyterian Church, Montpelier, OH to be granted a waiver from G-2.0404 which limits terms of ruling elders and deacons. **Motion carries.**

### Actions Taken on Behalf of Presbytery by Leadership Commission:

1. That R. James Miller be appointed Moderator of Eastminster Presbyterian Church beginning in September 2024
2. That the Rev. Don Giesmann, retired United Church of Christ minister (formerly PCUSA), be appointed Moderator of Eastminster Presbyterian Church, from June 1 through August 31, 2024.
3. That the Commission validate the ministry of the Rev. Cathy Johnson as chaplain to the Dominican Sisters at Adrian, MI for the year 2024. She was inadvertently left off our January action.
4. To dissolve the pastoral relationship between Tom James and Eastminster PC, effective May 31, 2024, and when requested, transfer his membership to Detroit Presbytery.
5. To request the transfer of the Rev. Mark Stephen Merold, HR, from Scioto Valley Presbytery and receive him as a member of MVP as honorably retired. Stephen served at Celina for many years and now lives in Kenton with his wife.
6. Appointed Ed Bettendorf as Moderator of both sessions at First Presbyterian Church and Eastside Presbyterian Church in Fremont, OH, effective July 1, 2024.
7. Approved the contract between Lance Wiesmann and Cadmus Presbyterian Church, Adrian MI, effective July 1 through Dec. 31, 2024 with no renewal. Cash \$ 500 per week; Minister's Choice including Medical Coverage of \$ 300 (per month); \$ 2000 professional expense; \$ 750 Continuing Ed expenses reimbursable; 1 week vacation, 4 days con ed. In addition, appointed Lance Wiesmann as Moderator of Cadmus Presbyterian Church effective July 1, 2024.
8. Approved the terms of call to Amy Remaklus as part time pastor at Ottawa Presbyterian Church, effective August 1, 2024. She is also the Director of the Toledo Campus Ministry at the University of Toledo. These terms of call were negotiated in concert with Amy, the TCM Board of Directors, and the PNC at Ottawa, with help from Luke Choi from the Board of Pensions.

Cash Salary	\$ 13,420.00
Housing allowance	\$ 12,500.00
½ SECA	\$ 1,982.88
Business/Professional expenses)	\$ 4,000.00 (Cell phone, mileage, travel expenses)
Continuing Education	\$ 1,500.00
10% Pension contribution	10% of effective Salary
BOP Medical Insurance 2024	29% of effective salary
BOP Medical Insurance 2025	33% of effective salary

Paid Vacation 4 Weeks including 4 Sundays  
Paid Continuing Education 2 Weeks including 2 Sundays

9. Approved the contract between the Rev. Julie Kling and First United Presbyterian Church of Pemberville, OH beginning August 14, 2024 for a two- year period with a 60 day out clause for either party. Twenty hours per week. Annual terms Salary \$ 20,935.38; housing allowance \$ 6,280.61; negotiated medical reimbursement \$ 4200 (HRA) – Effective Salary \$ 31,415.99; Minister’s Choice/ Covenant package plus FICA Allowance of \$ 2401.32; Reimbursables for prof expenses and continuing education of \$ 5500 annually. Total \$ 42,462,36 annually for 2024 with projected raise in January of 2025 of \$ 1416 per year with the proper adjustments to benefits.
10. Approved the dissolution of pastoral relationship between the Rev. Mary Beth McCandless and the West Bethesda and West Eagle Creek congregations effective September 30, 2024; and upon their request, to dismiss Mary Beth McCandless to Ohio Valley Presbytery. She has accepted a call as pastor of First Presbyterian Church, Evansville, IN. She is a member of MVP in very good standing.
11. Concurred with the action of the Bluffton congregation for them to form a PNC. The call to Matthew Zuelhke was withdrawn by vote of the congregation on August 25, 2024.

**Goings and Comings (Packet 7e)**

Coming: Lance Wiesmann at Cadmus  
Julie Kling at Pemberville  
Amy Remaklus at Ottawa  
Elizabeth Hadley at Findley Faith  
Stephen Merold, HR (moving back to MVP)

Going: Mary Beth McCandless to Evansville, IN

**The Moderator led in the Recognition of Honorable Retirement from the Ministry of Word and Sacrament and from the ministry of Commissioned Ruling Elder for Jim Miller, TE; Mike Roadruck, CRE; retirements**

The Leadership Commission continued their report with the **F A C T Team** (Packet 7c), Jeff Schooley  
Financial Analysis for Churches in Transition – TOOL  
Economic realities (5 year; 10 year) and 2) Housing

**Vision Team** (Packet 7d) made their report.

The Vision Team will have periodic articles in the presbytery newsletter on the topic of shared ministry and other ideas to strengthen the churches in our presbytery. Today, the Vision Team presents some ideas to help your congregation discern its ministry into the future. At the November Presbytery meeting, the team will host an Open Space to dig into these questions and explore options for pastoral support to consider.

Open Spaces in November – bring all the people!  
Regional Gatherings will be happening - reach out to Ann Wasson or Jeanne Gay to be a part.

5:52 Good News from Churches –  
Napoleon – Bruce - giving away glow rings for Halloween; Nov Election Eve Supper; Dec Caroling.  
Findlay – Leslee Kirkconnell – Presbytery Wide Lock in October 12 and 13  
Tiffin – Ken Kreiger – Kirkmont Board – good things happening – good budget year – ask congregations to donate; activities much of the year; fall family weekend; fall work day; all camping has increased.  
Ottawa – Amy – stewardship – worship is all of life  
Toledo Campus Ministries – CROP Hunger Walk – Sunday, Sept 22

**At 6:02, a blessing was offered and the presbytery took a recess for Dinner in Hanson Hall.**

**At 7:00 the acting moderator requested a motion that the benediction of the worship service serve as adjournment of our meeting. Second. So ordered.**

**Worship** included General Assembly commissioner reports from RE Norma Wible, TE Doug Holmes and TSAD Janet Brehms Taylor (virtually).

Next stated meeting on **Tuesday, November 19, 2024, at First Presbyterian Church in Bryan, OH beginning at 10am.**

Respectfully submitted,

Attested,

Mary Beth McCandless  
Journal Clerk

Dean McGormley  
Stated Clerk

Attachments:  
TBD